

EQUINET SEMINAR

Not on Our Watch – Raising Equality Bodies fighting Hate Speech

19-21 November 2018

LOCATION: Rome, Italy

BACKGROUND INFORMATION AND CONTEXT

Illegal hate speech is defined in EU law¹ as the **public incitement to violence or hatred directed to groups or individuals on the basis of certain characteristics, including race, colour, religion, descent and national or ethnic origin.**

There are different legal bases evident across Europe for addressing hate speech. These are: criminal law, misdemeanour law, civil law or administrative law. Each approach has its advantages and disadvantages and, in some countries hate speech is tackled in more than one of these legal spheres. Definitions at national level focus on the issue of incitement of hatred across a wide range of grounds. **The predominant grounds that are focused on are racial or ethnic origin, sexual orientation, gender, gender identity or gender expression, and religion.** The 2008 Framework Decision of the EU Council on Racism and Xenophobia is useful with regard to definitions². Shared definitions of hate speech have been aided by jurisprudence within the European Court of Human Rights. However, there are still **significant differences in the definition of hate speech and of sensitivity of the Courts to the issue across different countries.**

A number of equality bodies have an explicit mandate in relation to hate speech. Other equality bodies interpret their mandate to include a focus on hate speech. This is enabled where the body is a multi-mandate body with a human rights mandate. Some equality bodies have no mandate to focus on hate speech. However, often these bodies find themselves dealing with hate speech in relation to addressing issues of harassment and sexual harassment as **the borders between harassment and hate speech are not always clear cut. This holds a potential for equality bodies to act against certain types of hate speech even in the absence of a clear and specific mandate.**

The main objective of the Seminar is to **build the individual capacity of equality bodies' staff members** to deal with hate speech both on and off line. The seminar seeks to answer the following questions:

- What is our **understanding** of the phenomenon of hate speech, including who carries it out, why and on what grounds?
- How can equality bodies **prevent hate speech** via their systems, communication and policies, including training and recommendations for educators, media and policy makers, as well as by joining forces with various stakeholders?
- What **legal, policy and communication approaches** help equality bodies to **manage** the phenomenon of hate speech once it has taken place?

¹ Framework Decision on combating certain forms and expressions of racism and xenophobia by means of criminal law <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=LEGISSUM:I33178>

² See Article 1 of the [Council Framework Decision 2008/913/JHA of 28 November 2008 on combating certain forms and expressions of racism and xenophobia by means of criminal law](#)

Monday 19 November: UNDERSTANDING HATE SPEECH

Address....

9:30-10:00 Welcome & Registration at Italian government buildings

OPENING

10:00-10:30 **Tena Šimonović Einwalter**, Chair of Equinet Executive Board
Alessandra Ponari, Head of Department for Equal Opportunities, Presidency of the Council of Ministers, Italy

KEYNOTE SPEECH

10:30-11:00 Understanding hate speech in Europe
Dr. Tarlach McGonagle
 Senior researcher, Institute for Information Law (IViR), University of Amsterdam

SESSION 1: WHAT IS HATE SPEECH?

Chair:

11:00-11:20 Hate speech in the Public Online Debate in Denmark
Lumi Zuleta
 Senior Advisory, Danish Institute for Human Rights

11:20-11:40 Understanding the perpetrators of hate speech in Ireland
Walter Jayawardene
 Senior Policy Officer, Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission

11:40-12:00 **Questions & Answers**

12:00-13:30 **Lunch & Move to Hotel**

*Hotel Quirinale
 (Via Nazionale, 7, 00184 Roma)*

13:30-14:00 Icebreaker with Facilitator Namir Chowdhury

WORKSHOP 1: IDENTIFYING HATE SPEECH

Participants will visit both workshops for an hour each

Workshops	HATE SPEECH IN CASE LAW	HATE SPEECH ONLINE
14:00-16:15	<p>Presentation & Case Study: Hate speech in the European Court of Human Rights</p> <p>Speaker:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Onur Andreotti, Jurisconsult Directorate, European Court of Human Rights 	<p>Presentation & Case Study: Identifying hate speech on social media</p> <p>Speakers:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Louisa Klingvall, Fundamental Rights Policy, DG Just, European Commission Fadzai Madzingira, Facebook Roberto Burtone, UNAR, Italy

SESSION 2: WHAT HAVE WE LEARNT?

16:15-16:45	Plenary session with short feedback from participants
Evening	Social event

Tuesday 20 November: FULL CYCLE OF A COMPLAINT

Hotel Quirinale

KEYNOTE SPEECH 2

9:00-9:30	My experience of hate speech Victim's perspective
9:30-9:45	Questions & Answers
9:45-10:00	Warm-up with Facilitator Namir Chowdhury

SESSION 3: TOOLS TO TACKLE HATE SPEECH

Chair:

10:00-10:20	ECRI GPR No.15 on Combating Hate Speech – Highlights for Equality Bodies	Menno Ettema , Anti-Discrimination Department, No Hate Speech and Cooperation unit, Council of Europe (TBC)
10:20-10:45	Tools equality bodies use to tackle hate speech	Niall Crowley , author of Equinet Perspective
10:45-11:00	Toolkit used to combat hate speech in Belgium	Astrid Eichstadt , Unia, Belgium
11:00-11:15	Questions & Answers	
11:15-11:45	Coffee Break	

WORKSHOP 2: FULL CYCLE OF A COMPLAINT

Participants will visit 2 workshops for an hour each

Workshops	Dealing with a complaint – from the perspective of different types of bodies		Preventing hate speech	Managing Hate Speech
	Promotional	Quasi-Judicial		
11:45-14:45	Speaker: Annelies Cardon , Institute of Equality between Women and Men, Belgium	Speaker: National Council for Combating Discrimination, Romania (TBC)	Presentation: Silence Hate / Media against Hate Speakers: Udo C. Enwereuzor , COSPE Onlus	Presentation: The negative portrayal of Muslims in the Polish press Speakers: Kultura Liberalna's Public Debate Observatory (TBC) Joanna Subko , Commissioner for Human Rights, Poland
12:45-13:45	Lunch			

14:45-15:00	Feedback from Workshops in Plenary	
PANEL DEBATE: LEGISLATIVE CHANGE ON HATE SPEECH? Chair: Kirsi Pimiä, Non-Discrimination Ombud, Finland		
15:00-16:15	Should there be laws dealing with hate speech, and if so, how would they look?	Jugendschutz (TBC) Article 19 (TBC) Maryant Fernández Pérez, European Digital Rights (EDRi)
16:15-16:30	Closing	

Wednesday 21 November: WAYS FORWARD <i>Hotel Quirinale</i>		
SESSION 4: PROMISING PRACTICES Chair:		
09:30-10:30	Monitoring and Countering Hate Speech	Melissa Sonnino , Facing Facts Online (CEJI - A Jewish Contribution to an Inclusive Europe)
	Alternatives to Hate Speech	Allesandra Coppola , No Hate Speech Movement, Italy
	Safety of Female Journalists online #SOFJO	Jennifer Adams , Office of the OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media (TBC)
	Training?	Love-storm, Germany (TBC)
10:30-11:00	Coffee Break	
OPEN DISCUSSION: STRATEGIES TO ADVANCE ON HATE SPEECH Chair: Petr Pólak		
11:00-12:30	<p>Innovative Ideas: Have you identified any innovative ideas to tackle hate speech in the seminar? How could innovation be implemented in communication in particular, in order to support your work?</p> <p>Unlocking the barriers: What are your biggest challenges to effectively tackling hate speech? What support do you need to engage with hate speech? What alliances and links need to be made for you to advance with your work on this topic?</p> <p>Leadership: How can equality bodies be more visible and show leadership to other institutions on the topic? What do we need to act as a knowledge hub to generate shared understanding of this phenomenon and to resource others to take steps on the issue?</p>	
CLOSING SESSION		
12:30-13:00	Luigi Manconi , Director, UNAR Anne Gaspard , Equinet Executive Director	
13:00– 14:00	Lunch Break	

FURTHER READING

Online Learning

- Facing Facts Online Course on Hate Speech <http://www.facingfacts.eu/page/facing-facts-online-course-hate-speech>

European Level Reading

- European Commission: Countering illegal hate speech online – overview http://ec.europa.eu/newsroom/just/item-detail.cfm?item_id=54300
- Council of Europe’s European Commission against Racism and Intolerance GPR No. 15 on Combating Hate Speech <https://www.coe.int/en/web/freedom-expression/hate-speech>
- European Court of Human Rights Factsheet on Hate Speech: https://www.echr.coe.int/Documents/FS_Hate_speech_ENG.pdf
- Council of Europe - Handbook on Protecting the right to freedom of expression under the European Convention on Human Rights: <https://rm.coe.int/handbook-freedom-of-expression-eng/1680732814>
- The Council of Europe against online hate speech: Conundrums and challenges <https://rm.coe.int/16800c170f>
- Council of Europe, We can! Taking action against hate speech through counter and alternative narratives: <http://www.equineteurope.org/We-can-Taking-action-against-hate-speech-through-Counter-and-Alternative>
- Council of Europe, Bookmarks - Manual for combating hate speech through human rights education: <https://www.coe.int/en/web/no-hate-campaign/bookmarks-connexions>
- European Parliament (FEMM Committee): Cyber violence and hate speech online against women [http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2018/604979/IPOL_STU\(2018\)604979_EN.pdf](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2018/604979/IPOL_STU(2018)604979_EN.pdf)
- Articles 19: Hate Speech Explained. A Toolkit: <https://www.article19.org/data/files/medialibrary/38231/'Hate-Speech'-Explained---A-Toolkit-%282015-Edition%29.pdf>

Publications by Equality Bodies

- Danish Institute of Human Rights: Hate Speech in the Public Online Debate <http://www.equineteurope.org/Hate-speech-in-the-public-online-debate>
- Equality and Antidiscrimination Ombud, Norway: Hate speech and hate crime http://www.ldo.no/globalassets/03_nyheter-og-fag/publikasjoner/hate-speech-and-hate-crime.pdf
- Equality and Human Rights Commission, UK: Freedom of Expression <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/en/advice-and-guidance/freedom-expression>
- Equality and Human Rights Commission, UK: Talking about Human Rights. How to identify and engage a range of audiences <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/en/human-rights/talking-about-human-rights-how-identify-and-engage-range-audiences>